



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

An Examination of Historical Themes in Pakistan Studies for Higher Secondary: A Comparison Between Sindh and Federal Boards

Waheed Murad

Lecturer in Pakistan Studies, Government National College No. 2

Ph.D. Scholar, Department of History, University of Karachi

Email: wmuradchang@gmail.com

Sufi Imdad Ali Soomro*

Ph.D. Scholar in Law, Dadabhoy Institute of Higher Education, Karachi

Email: imdadnoor@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

This study critically examines the representation of historical content in Pakistan Studies textbooks prescribed by the Sindh and Federal Boards for Grade XII. It focuses on three chapters from the Sindh textbook, The Establishment of Pakistan, History of Pakistan, and Political Developments in Pakistan and compares them with the first three chapters from the Federal textbook, Ideological Basis of Pakistan, Making of Pakistan, and Constitutional Development in the Islamic Republic of Pakistan. Since these chapters' address overlapping historical themes, they are collectively analyzed under the theme "Basis of Pakistan: A Controversy." The research employs qualitative analysis to explore variations in interpretation, ideological framing, and historical emphasis between the two boards. This research paper is reinterpreted through newly developed subheadings to highlight differences in perspective and narrative approach. The findings reveal how regional and institutional contexts influence the portrayal of Pakistan's history and identity, emphasizing the need for balanced, inclusive, and critically informed textbook narratives.

KEYWORDS: Pakistan Studies, History Education, Textbook Analysis, Sindh Board, Federal Board, Ideological Narrative, Curriculum Comparison, National Identity, Qualitative Analysis

INTRODUCTION

First chapter of Sindh textbook starts with Arab invasion in South Asia. The conditions of that time have been mentioned in the chapter as how the circumstances changed after the advent of Islam.¹ It is broadly explained in the Sindh textbook. However, there is no material about the Arab Invaders and the spread of Islam but it could be comprehended if the national curriculum is followed.

Generally, Pakistan studies subject is considered as a boring and academic burden on students at school, college and university level. Managements, students, exam boards and even majority of the private school teachers have same opinion regarding the subject. Unfortunately, authorities of the academic institutions do not prefer the subject specialist teacher having relevant degree in Pakistan studies but the policy of improvisation can be seen in this regard. Meanwhile, they appoint any other teacher with social science background for teaching of Pakistan Studies. Therefore, due to distinct qualification of such teachers he/she is unable to show his/her interest regarding the subject. For that reason, the subject does not appeal the students to take interest in it. Furthermore, as most of the areas of Pakistan studies is related to the history, therefore it's important to discuss the history here.



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

History is a complex field of study encompassing various areas of social sciences. It is unique, and probably the only subject in which a scribe is skeptical while presenting “facts” or historical facts which are facts for some and rumors for others.

In 712 CE, governor of Iraq, Hajaj bin Yousuf sent his nephew Muhammad bin Qasim to Sindh and gave him a trained and well equipped army.³ Muhammad bin Qasim attacked Sindh. After the conquest of Sindh, the attack of Muhammad Bin Qasim paved the way for other invaders.

Pakistan studies is a multidimensional subject where a student studies history, geography, environmental studies, law, economics, politics, society, international relations etc. This variation makes Pakistan Studies subject unique for students.

Political relations with Sindh started during the period of Muslim caliphs, during the era of Hazrat Umar RA (634-644 CE). The Muslim navy attacked “Thana” (Which is near to Bombay) but Later Hazrat Umar RA forbade his soldiers to attack, when Hazrat Usman RA (644-656 CE) became the caliph he sent Hakeem bin Jabla for exploring the Sub continent. However, Hakeem submitted his report and declared that this is not the accurate place for invasion²

OBJECTIVE OF THE RESEARCH

To facilitate the students in learning Pakistan Studies textbook.

To motivate the students regarding the subject

To facilitate the teachers regarding the teaching of Pakistan studies

This work can guide the curriculum developers.

This work will create awareness for studying textbooks.

To highlight the incorrect historical events from the textbooks

METHODOLOGY

Qualitative Research is followed in this research. Both primary and secondary sources will be tested in this research. Although primary sources are important and valuable sources to conduct and analyze the research but secondary sources of research will also be used in this research. In this connection, the researcher visited various libraries. Analysis of statements, books, journals, magazines, newspapers, government records and has taken interviews from educationist, historian, students and subject experts. It is made for the purpose of this research.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Ideology of Pakistan

Ideology is not a very easy topic to understand, it's a complex phenomenon. Ideology has been defined by different authors, French philosopher Ausoine Destull De Tracy says, “study of the origins, evolution, and nature of ideas is called ideology⁴ According to Karl Mannehiem, ideology based on conservative and self-seeking views of dominant class.⁵

The ideology of Pakistan was the platform on which all the Muslims of the sub-continent got united and the concept of a separate homeland was initiated. The Muslims wanted to enforce sovereignty of God Almighty; they wanted to establish Islamic democracy, the revival of the Muslim, protection of Muslim culture and civilization. In these circumstances, the “two nation theory” further strengthened this stance and the British government finally agreed for the partitioning United India.⁶

Aligarh Movement

Sir Syed was the first person who used the word “nation” for Muslims. After the war of independence, the British did not trust the Muslims due to which “they adopted a



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

policy of oppression and repression against Muslims.”⁷ It impacted the Muslims of the sub-continent socially, culturally, and politically, and “Within a small period, the Muslims were able to get over much of their educational backwardness.”⁸

Lucknow Pact

In December 1916, a joint session was held at Lucknow by Muslim League and Indian National Congress where this pact was presented and was approved by the then Viceroy. Common features of this pact were:

Separate electorates

Weightage in Provinces

No bill affecting a specific group would be passed if three-fourths of the representatives of that community opposed it. A tremendous situation of understanding and cooperation could have been generated but the Hindus did not adhere to the principles honestly.⁹

Khilafat Movement

The topic is included in the national curriculum and discussed in both textbooks. Sindh textbook only focused on background and conditions. However, the Federal textbook explains it a little bit. Apart from background and conditions, the results of the movement are also analyzed. So, this is commendable in Federal textbook.

Khilafat is known as "Semi-religious political system of governance in Islam."¹⁰

Turkey fought the war from Germany's side, the main enemy of Great Britain because the circumstances compelled Turkey (Ottoman Empire) to fight against the Allies. After losing the war, Turkey faced many problems and the Indian Muslims naturally attached their sympathies with their Turkish brethren.¹¹

Moulana Muhammad Ali and Shoukat Ali Johar started this movement, Jinnah was in England and he refused to be a part of this movement because he thought that Mohan Das Karam Chand is using religion as a tool for his own purpose. The Movement put Moulana Muhammad Ali, Mulana Shaukat Ali, Moulana Abul Kalam Azad, and other prominent leaders in prison.¹² The government understood the gravity of the situation, so to calm down the people British PM Lyod George presented a statement before the parliament that it wasn't the intention of the government to deprive the Turks of their homelands.¹³

For the Muslims, it ended in complete failure, “the reaction on Gandhi's betrayal amongst the Muslims was bitter and strong. They felt betrayed at the end when victory was almost achieved.”¹⁴

Foundation of Muslim League

The next topic in the National Curriculum is the foundation of the Muslim league which is given in both textbooks. In Sindh textbook, it's discussed from seed to stem. On the other side, in the Federal textbook, it's discussed in a general sense.

Muslims had to face many problems in India. To solve this problem, they held a meeting in Dhaka in December 1906. A resolution for establishing a Muslim organization was moved by Nawab of Dacca and Nawab Vaqar ul Mulk delivered a presidential address. The main objectives of this were to show the loyalty of Muslims to the British government and to protect Muslim rights. The main reason which led to the formation of the Muslim League was Congress's attitude towards Muslims¹⁵

The struggle of Provinces

This topic is only mentioned in the Sindh textbook but not in the Federal textbook. In



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

this topic, the struggle of all four provinces, KPK, Baluchistan, Sindh, and Punjab are discussed

Punjab was the majority province. The Sikhs controlled it in 1849 after the death of Aurangzeb Alamgeer. Many philosophers, Sufis, and thinkers from Punjab contributed a lot to the Pakistani movement. The Lahore resolution was held in Punjab. During the disobedience movement, Sughra Begum, an activist from Lahore hoisted the Muslim league's flag on the secretariat of Punjab. All over Punjab the students worked hard to convey the message of the Muslim league.

Sindh known as the Bab-ul-Islam, was taken over by the British in 1843, and became an administrative part of Bombay. In 1935, it regained the status of a separate province. The first annual session of Muslim League was held in Karachi. The branch of Sindh (of the Muslim league) for the first time demanded the establishment of a Muslim government. Syed Sibghatullah Shah, known as the Pir Sahib Pagaro, began an armed movement against Britain during the Second World War. Students of Sindh Madrassat-ul-Islam and Noor Muhammad school took part in the Pakistan movement.

Balochistan maintained its independent identity even during British rule. They accepted Quaid e Azam's appeal. Qazi Muhammad Isa who established the Muslim league in Balochistan was from Balochistan. Other prominent leaders such as Mir Jaffar Khan Jamali, Sardar Baz Khan, Nawab Muhammad Khan Jogezi, and Mir Qadir Baksh Zehri worked a lot to convey the message of Muslim League in Balochistan.

North West frontier province (now KPK) is famous for its bravery and patriotism. This province was kept backward by the British government. Quaid e Azam demanded reforms in NWFP, in 1928. After the struggles of Sardar Aurangabad Khan, the conference of the Muslim League was held at Abbottabad in 1939. During the civil disobedience movement, the students of Islamia College and Edward College were on the front line. Due to these efforts and sacrifices, Congress lost its control over NWFP, and it became a part of Pakistan in 1947.¹⁶

Quaid e Azam's fourteen points

After the Nehru report, Quaid e Azam gave his 14 points on March 1929.¹⁷ The 14 points of Quaid e Azam are explained in the Sindh textbook but in Federal textbook the date of 14 points has been given. Moreover, it is also not a part of the national curriculum.

Round table conferences

It is described in the Sindh textbook but in the federal textbook this event is mentioned only once as a point under the subheading, "Proposal for the solution of constitutional problems", but no comprehensive material on this topic is given.

The first session of this conference was held on 12 November 1930 in London. All the political parties of India participated in this conference except Congress. The decision that was taken at the end of the conference was to form the federal government in India. Members of the Muslim League, Muhammad Shadi, and Quaid e Azam demanded responsible central government. This session ended on 19 January 1931 and prime Minister, Ramsay MacDonald accepted to establish a responsible federal and provincial government.

On September 7, 1931, the second session of this conference was held. Mr. Gandhi participated as a representative of Congress. Allama Muhammad Iqbal also took part in the conference. The main issue to be discussed was Hindu-Muslim relationship.



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

Gandhi adopted arrogant behavior and denied all the rights of minorities. He rejected the presence of other communities in India except for Hindus. This conference ended on 1 December 1931, without any decision being reached because of the stubborn attitude of Gandhi.

On his return to India, he again started the civil disobedience movement and was arrested. The third conference of this session began on 17 November 1932 and lasted till 24 November 1937. In this conference, Quaid e Azam did not participate and Sir Agha Khan was the representative of Muslim league. During this conference, Gandhi, Nehru, and other leaders were imprisoned, so this conference also ended up without any conclusion.¹⁸

Allahabad address

The address of Allahabad is not according to the national curriculum that's why the federal textbook does not explain the topic but the Sindh textbook does.

The annual session of the All India Muslim League was held at Allahabad, in 1930, presided over by Doctor Allama Muhammad Iqbal. He boldly discussed the political condition of the subcontinent at length. He clarified the concept of two nation theory and "it was the first occasion when the demand for a separate homeland was made from Muslim league's platform"¹⁹

Government of India act 1935

This is not included in the national curriculum, so the federal textbook just mentions its name and does not give any detail. However, in Sindh textbook it is written comprehensively. No conclusion had been made in the Round table conferences but there was one benefit of those, the problems of Muslims were highlighted in front of the British government. The British government passed a bill on 24 July 1935 which was named as Government of India act. This act contained 14 parts and 10 schedules. It has two parts. On April 1, 1937, the act came into operation except for part 2. The main feature of this act was to provide more powers to Provinces. Three lists of subjects were drawn up that were federal, provincial, and concurrent lists. The rights of minorities were secured. But the act failed to satisfy some political sections of the country. Different political parties in India rejected this act of 1935.²⁰

Lahore Resolution/Pakistan Resolution 1940

Pakistan resolution, an important topic in Pakistan studies which is included in the national curriculum is written in both books but it is broadly explained in the Federal textbook as compared to the Sindh textbook.

In Minto Park, the 27th annual session of the Muslim League was held under the leadership of Quaid e Azam and the famous Lahore or later Pakistan Resolution was passed on 24th March 1940. Jinnah cleared that Hindus and Muslims can't be a single nation.²¹

Cripps proposal of 1942

The next topic according to the national curriculum, "Cripps Mission" is included in both textbooks but the difference is that the Federal textbook has explained it much better than the Sindh one. In the initial stages of the 2nd world war, the British faced many problems. Therefore, to seek the support of Indians, the British government appointed a delegation under the leadership of Sir Stafford Cripps. He reached New



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

Delhi on 23 March 1942 for a discussion with Indian leaders. According to this proposal, India will get independence at the end of the 2nd world war. New Constitution would be of federal form and minorities would be given full rights. Provinces would be empowered to leave the federation. The union of India will be given Dominion status. The provinces would be given rights either to stay with the government or to separate. Congress and Muslim leagues rejected the proposal. According to Congress, that was an opportunity for them to build pressure on Britain to quit India as they were engaged in war and the Muslim league rejected it because there was no clarification for the separation of Pakistan.²²

General Election

These elections are elaborated in the Federal textbook as compared to the Sindh textbook and are also a part of the national curriculum. No general election had been held since 1934 to the central legislature and since 1937 to the provincial assemblies, the viceroy on 21st August announced the elections to the central and provincial legislatures to be scheduled in the upcoming winter. Muslim league won the election with a clear majority. It was the achievement of the Muslim league. This was proof that Muslim League was the real representative of Muslims in the subcontinent.²³

Quit India Movement and Gandhi Jinnah talks

It is not written in the Federal textbook abiding by the national curriculum but it is included in the Sindh textbook. To pressurize the British government and to get independence, Gandhi started a movement named Quit India Movement. Quaid e Azam declared this movement as blackmailing. In response to this movement Muslim league raised a slogan "Divide India and quit". The British government took action against this movement and put its leaders in prison, as a result of which the movement failed. Gandhi was released from prison in 1944 and initiated talks with Quaid e Azam on 19 September 1944 in Bombay which lasted till 24 September 1944. Quaid e Azam demanded Pakistan during these talks and cleared that Muslims and Hindus were two separate nations while Gandhi maintained that India was one nation. In the end, Quaid e Azam did not accept the proposal, and the talks ended.²⁴

Simla Conference

This topic is included in both textbooks and the national curriculum as well. At the end of the war, Lord Wavell came to Simla on 24 June 1945 to discuss his plan. Representatives of the Muslim league were Quaid e Azam, Liaquat Ali Khan, Khawaja Nizam Uddin, Sir Muhammad Asad Ullah, Ghulam Hussain Hidayat Ullah, and Hussain Imam while Gandhi, Maulana Abdul Kalam Azad, Khizar Hayat Tiwana, Dr. Khan Sahib and some other leaders were the representatives of Congress. Lord Wavell proposed an interim government in which all the offices shall be filled by Indian members except that of war. The members of Muslims shall be equal in number to the Hindus. He suggested that four members of the executive council should be taken from the Muslim league while the 5th member should not belong to the Muslim league. Congress rejected the Muslim league's claim to be the sole representative of Muslims. Quaid e Azam demanded general elections at the end of the conference.²⁵

Cabinet Mission Plan

It is an important topic given in the National curriculum and written in both books but the difference is that the Sindh textbook described it shortly in contrast to the Federal textbook. For the solution to the Indian deadlock, a 3-member British cabinet headed



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

by the Secretary of State for India arrived in New Delhi.

According to the Plan India would be divided into three parts.

The main features of the cabinet plan were as under

Responsibility for foreign affairs, defense, and communication shall be given to a union of subcontinents.

All other affairs except those mentioned above shall be the responsibility of provinces. Provinces shall be given the right to form their own groups/government and each group shall frame a constitution for itself.

After ten years, any provincial government shall be authorized to demand change in the constitution. But due to some reasons, it wasn't successful.²⁶

Formation of the Interim government

This topic is added in both textbooks but in the federal textbook efforts of Liaquat Ali Khan are noted which is not the case in Sindh textbook. The Congress took a sharp turn and accepted the plan of 16 May. The situation was tumultuous. At that time Jinnah had spoken out boldly, "if you want to arrest me now, I'm ready to go to prison immediately". However, on September 2 the interim government took office without the representatives of the Muslim league. The confusion in the politics of India had become more confounded. British Prime Minister Atlee cleared that they will try to transfer power to responsible Indian hands no Later than June 1948.²⁷

3rd June Plan

Again here, the federal textbook explains the topic by giving background, circumstances and features of this plan are written while in Sindh textbook it is briefly written.

In the middle of April 1947, Lord Mountbatten made out a partition plan. Congress and the Muslim League both accepted the plan. This plan was issued on June 3rd, 1947 and the main points were that Punjab and Bengal shall decide whether the provinces would be divided or not. The referendum shall be held in NWFP. Baluchistan will adopt an appropriate way to decide its future. States shall be free to be joined with other states or to remain as Free states. Both countries shall have their separate governor generals and military assets shall be divided after partition. This plan was accepted by both parties.²⁸

Indian independence Act

This topic is mentioned in the national curriculum and given in federal textbook but not in Sindh textbook. The viceroy of India announced the partition plan on 4 July 1947. According to this plan, India would be divided into two separate states and will get independence on 15 August 1947. Princely states were given rights either to stay independent or to join one of the two countries. 1935 act will remain enforced until both countries frame their constitutions.²⁹

The emergence of Pakistan

"Emergence of Pakistan" is mentioned in the Federal textbook following the national curriculum but is not mentioned in the Sindh textbook. British Constituent Assembly approved the Independence of Act 1947, by which Pakistan came into existence as the biggest Islamic State in the world.³⁰



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

INITIAL PROBLEMS OF PAKISTAN

It is the second chapter of both books with different names here is comparative analysis of these two chapters. The history of Pakistan is dynamic in which many ups and downs came, because in India there were two nations, “Muslims and Hindus” and both were opposite to each other. Chapter 2 of Sindh textbook starts from World War II (1939 to 1945) till partition of Pakistan.³¹ Chapter 2 of federal textbook the history starts from 3rd June plan.³² On the other side the history of Pakistan starts from Cripps Mission 1942.³³ One of them tells the history of Pakistan following the Indian independence act.³⁴ The Sindh textbook does not tell the whole history but it starts from early history of Pakistan. While federal textbook failed to give the early history of Pakistan. If the early history of Pakistan is important so why only Sindh textbook explained it but federal one did not. In National Curriculum the topic of background is present but national curriculum does not signify starting point of Pakistan history.³⁵

Radcliff and Injustice

In 1947 when Muslims and Hindus eventually decided that that they could not live together under the government of British, British law lord sent Cyril John Radcliff in India as a boundary Commissioner. He divided India into two parts.³⁶ Before this topic Sindh textbook describes the points of Indian independence act 1935. In Sindh textbook Bengal and Punjab were in favor of partition. The last viceroy of India appointed lawyer Cyril Radcliff as a partition officer. In Jinnah’s view the partition was a very serious matter so it should go in “UNO” but this was rejected by congress, then Jinnah gave another suggestion that British Primary Council must solve this issue but Lord Mountbatten rejected.

Lord Mountbatten announced boundaries of both countries; he said that the areas where the Muslims were in majority will join Pakistan. But Radcliff’s way of partitioning was totally different and one-sided because some areas of Muslims majority had been given to India like Jammu & Kashmir.³⁷ In federal textbook Radcliff announced the boundaries on 17 Aug 1947.³⁸ In other history books India and Pakistan agreed to Radcliff’s decision and partition of Pakistan faced many problems and is still facing the Kashmir issue.³⁹ in Sindh textbook the introduction of Radcliff is present, while the federal textbook failed to give the introduction of Radcliff. Both textbooks published the Radcliff’s way of partitioning in different ways. In National Curriculum the topic of injustice of Radcliff is present, and both textbooks published this topic in their own way.⁴⁰

Results of Injustice

The partition of India became the result of injustice of Radcliff because Calcutta, Ferozpur, and Gurdaspur where the Muslims were in majority, but Radcliff still gave these areas to India.⁴¹ In federal textbook 3 outcomes came due to injustice of Radcliff Kashmir issue, fate of Calcutta, problems created during migration. Kashmir is connected with Gurdaspur but when Gurdaspur joined India so the Kashmir issue was born.

Calcutta had Muslims in majority but due to injustice of Radcliff Calcutta joined India.

During migration, Sikhs and Hindus made difficulties for Muslims migrants.⁴²

The results of injustice of Radcliff are mentioned in federal textbook but on the other hand Sindh textbook has not mentioned them. In National Curriculum this topic is present so federal textbook published it but on the other hand Sindh textbook did not.⁴³

According to partition plan 750 million were allotted to Pakistan but India gave only 700 million and that too with a lot of difficulties and still 50 million were not given.



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

The problem of refugees started from 3rd June plan and later Radcliff played with the people of Pakistan. He gave Muslims majority areas to India, so refugees migrated to Pakistan. During migration 12.5 million people migrated to Pakistan and 5 to 6 million were killed and some of them were injured which affected Pakistan badly because Pakistan had to rehabilitate the refugees. When both the countries got independence India was stable and had enough money to run their country but on the other hand, Pakistan didn't have enough, that's why Pakistan faced many problems initially.

India divided assets in their own favor and they used assets in useful way, and India had lots of resources that's why India developed comparatively quicker, but Pakistan did not get enough of the assets so it can be said that the division of assets was unequal.⁴⁴ Before the partition of India most of the people who worked as administrators were Hindus and Englishmen so after partition they all left Pakistan after which Pakistan faced administration problems due to the lack of expertise.

Firstly, the British government refused to give armed forces to Pakistan, but later Jinnah negotiated possible division of armed forces through his struggle.

The unfair partition of Punjab and Ferozepur gave birth to the water dispute because two of the rivers (Ravi and Sutlej) flow from India to Pakistan. So whenever India wants he shuts off the water supply and whenever he wants he lets it flow.

The princely states had two options, to join either India or Pakistan, but India attacked and captured some of them like Hyderabad, Jammu & Kashmir, and Calcutta etc.⁴⁵

Federal textbook also defined the initial problems of Pakistan like administrative problem, refugee's problem, water problem and problem of princely states. In federal textbook the problem of princely is published in detail. There were 580 princely states in India, at the time of partition Kashmir and Junagadh wanted to join Pakistan, in Hyderabad the rulers were Muslims and they wanted to remain with Pakistan, but Junagadh had the same problem as Hyderabad had.

When the Taliban attacked Kashmir, the Maharaja become frightened and asked help from India, India helped Kashmir for their own purpose and eventually Kashmir was seized.⁴⁶ This topic is present in National Curriculum of intermediate and both the textbooks gave details differently.⁴⁷

Effects

Due to hater policy of Indian government they never want to see Pakistan as a well-developed country. But Jinnah did the great work for resolution of these problems, Jinnah worked hard to guide the way and he said if everyone follows these points so Pakistan will be a developed country. First of all making of constitution was a major issue because without constitution country cannot run. Jinnah wanted to make Islamic constitution but due to some reasons it was not possible at that time, so the act of 1935 was adopted and Jinnah was elected as the first Governor General of Pakistan while Liaquat Ali Khan was elected as the first Prime Minister of Pakistan. Jinnah said to Liaquat Ali Khan to make five members Cabinet so they will work for Pakistan. Jinnah encouraged Public Servants for loyalty, it was important because Public Servants have many responsibilities and if they work hard with loyalty so definitely Pakistan will grow day by day. Opposition made propagandas against people of refugees etc., definitely they tried to undo Pakistan but Jinnah ignored these propagandas and only focused on development. He said to people of Pakistan to work harder, be united, be patient and believe in God and that no power can undo Pakistan.⁴⁸ In National Curriculum of Intermediate this topic is clearly present as "what actions



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

were taken to resolve the problems” which can be considered an important topic but only federal textbook has explained this, but why didn’t Sindh textbook publish this topic? It can leave a negative impact on the students.⁴⁹

National solidarity and stability

In Sindh textbook this topic named as “Quaid-e-Azam and the stability and consolidation of Pakistan”, this topic tells the leadership of Jinnah in the fight for Pakistan. Through his hard works, enthusiasm, passion, and the sacrifices of lots of people Pakistan was made. Jinnah thought that morality worked as a fountain master of all solutions to problems.⁵⁰ While in federal textbook this topic explains how to unite and stabilize the Pakistani nation, because antagonists of Pakistan attempted to stimulate geographical, linguistic and non-metropolitan dissimilarities among the nation of Pakistan, Jinnah obliged to people to stand combined and not to go down for quarry to the brain washing information spread by the opposition. On 9th Aug 1947 Jinnah proclaimed;

“Let you have faith to each other..... let you perform in twice shift if inevitable to build Pakistan undoubtedly pleased, genuinely integrate and truly mighty”.⁵¹

Addressing to the students of Decca University on 24th march 1948 Jinnah said;

“A big authority rests on you and the opposite now in addition at any time it is obligatory for you to work as a joined and well educated nation.”⁵²

Pakistan Constituent Assembly’s first meeting took place in Pakistan on 11 Aug 1947, unanimously appointing Jinnah to lead meetings, at the time deafening sound of clapping erupted.⁵³ On 14 Aug 1947 under the act of 1935 he was appointed as Governor General of Pakistan. Governor General does not have many powers but Jinnah was totally different because he was a favorite, and popular among people so he used many powers to serve Pakistan.⁵⁴ In comparison, it can be inferred that some differences are there in both textbooks in describing this topic. Jinnah’s speech at Decca University is published in federal textbook but not in Sindh textbook. In National Curriculum chapter 2 has this topic,⁵⁵ both textbooks published this topic but some inaccuracies are present in both textbooks.

Rehabilitation and refugees

The topic of Rehabilitation of Refugees is presented in Sindh textbook as a major problem regarding which Jinnah showed most of his attentiveness. Jinnah said to people to give support to their companions who are in hazard. In Oct 1947 Jinnah went to Lahore to familiarize the problems of refugees. He helped many refugees through food, cloths etc. On 30th Oct he said now it is your duty to support refugees and government of Pakistan, everyone helped generally in every helpful way.⁵⁶

While in federal textbook this topic describes that 6.5 million people migrated from India to Pakistan. Jinnah established a relief fund for refugees. Jinnah thought that refugees suffered in this bad situation because they are Muslims. People of Pakistan gave food, clothes, homes, and jobs to refugees, this was only possible due to self-efforts of Jinnah.⁵⁷ Jinnah worked day and night due which he health got affected badly and he fell ill, but peace and rest were difficult.⁵⁸

Both textbooks published this topic fully well, but still both textbooks have some difference like in federal textbook the number of refugees is written as 6.5 million who migrated to Pakistan, but in Sindh textbook it is written that the number of refugees was 12.6 million. In National Curriculum this topic is purely part of chapter



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

2nd intermediate syllabus.⁵⁹

Advice to government servants

In this topic Sindh textbook explains that Jinnah talked to government officers and he said, “you do not belong to any political party, not part of ruler class family, you are only government officers, friends and will work for the people. You are not supposed to go down and obey any pressure group, party, work for people and Pakistan fearlessly.⁶⁰ After this the government officers took it in a positive way and worked day and night then Pakistan came out of this crisis.⁶¹ While in federal textbook Jinnah encouraged and compelled government officers to work for nation building.⁶² In National Curriculum this topic is present in syllabus of Intermediate. Both textbooks published this topic honestly.⁶³

Advice to parochialism and ethnic prejudices

This topic showed that people have to stay away from parochialism and ethnic prejudices. Jinnah said to people on 15th June 1948. Through togetherness many victories can be chased. All people are Pakistanis as a one nation; none of you is Punjabi, Sindhi, Balochi, Pathan, or Bengali.⁶⁴ Jinnah visited all provinces and gave new hope he said be strong be loved towards people. Karachi was chosen as the capital of Pakistan in 1947 and till 1959.⁶⁵

In federal textbook this topic published as a named of “Fighting Regionalism and Parochialism”. Jinnah knew that there were a lot of people inside and outside of the country, all were at to loss in believing that Pakistan was a truth and that it was fated to live forever. They thought that Pakistan could be broke up by giving growth to the opinion of parochialism and regionalism.⁶⁶ During the address of first constituent assembly Jinnah said that in Muslim community; you have Pathans, Punjabis, Shias, Sunis and so on, while in Hindus community you have Brahmins, Vaishyas, Kshatriyas, also Bengali, Madrassis and so on all are one nation “Pakistani”. No power can rule on other nation especially 400 million souls it must be a lesson for all. Now you free to go your temples, Mosques or any other place of worship in this state of Pakistan.⁶⁷ In both textbooks showed that Jinnah was against the parochialism and ethnic prejudices. He wanted that people of Pakistan must be a nation. On many platform he tried to convince people of Pakistan that unity is everything, in both textbooks every information is suitable and authentic. In National Curriculum this topic is a part of chapter 2.⁶⁸

Fundamental principles for the economy of Pakistan

In Sindh textbook this topic tells about the principles for economy of Pakistan. In the opening ceremony of State Bank of Pakistan held on 1st July 1948 Jinnah said the economic system of West had generated almost not soluble problems for mankind, and many of people seems that only a miracle can protect it from failure that is not encountering the world.⁶⁹ The approving of Western economic philosophy and adoption will not in reaching the target of making delighted Pakistan. Must work for fortune in own way and hand over to the Muslim world such an economic system which is form on the Islamic opinion of equality of spirit and also social equality.⁷⁰

While in federal textbook this topic is named as “Fundamental Principles of economy the Jinnah’s vision”. Both textbooks talk about the early economy of Pakistan and how to make good economy in world race. In National Curriculum this topic is present in chapter 2nd of Intermediate syllabus.⁷¹



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

Foreign policy

This topic in Sindh textbook pointed that after the making of Pakistan Jinnah tried hard for UNO membership for Pakistan. Pakistan made understandable relations with many countries. Unity of Muslims countries was the main point of foreign policy. In early stages Pakistan faced difficulties in making of foreign relation and Pakistan blamed India for this,⁷² because in 1947 India's soldiers entered to Junagadh, firstly Junagadh decided to join Pakistan but Indian government violently occupied Junagadh with India.⁷³ After this India posted their forces along Pakistan border, and war on Pakistan. For the resolution of Kashmir issue decided table talks with Indian government and communicate with British Commonwealth to decrease the tension between Pakistan and India, work for calm and strength in their own regions

While in federal textbook elaborates that Jinnah wanted to make the relation with countries of the World. He noticed that foreign policy of Pakistan was found in the principles of bond with all nations. On the speech of 27th Aug 1948 Jinnah said all people of Pakistan passing through tough time, play of power politics that is being organizing on Palestine, Indonesia and Kashmir supposed to serve wonder, if all people will be united people can make their voice observed in the Councils of World.⁷⁴ Both textbooks fulfilled their responsibility to published this topic. In National Curriculum this topic is present in the syllabus of Intermediate.⁷⁵

Advice to the students

In this topic Sindh textbook proclaimed that Jinnah knew the role of students in nation. Youth is the future of every country. He brought attention on young generation, in his speech to students in Peshawar he said.

“Pay your full attention towards the achievement of knowledge. He adored the role of students in struggle of Pakistan but he instructed them to keep themselves away from roughness of politics.”⁷⁶

Through the great leadership qualities Jinnah achieved a separate independent for Muslims of Subcontinent, but he worked day and night for manufacturing it powerful and prosperous. He made the guiding principles for newly born state and said all people supposed to follow these rules. It is everyone's responsibility to make Pakistan prosperous on world map. During addressing the historic public gathering at Lahore Jinnah said:

“It is your duty to work, work and work and all are bound to succeed and never neglect the Motto – Unity, discipline and faith.”⁷⁷

In National Curriculum this topic is present in syllabus of Intermediate⁷⁸. It is present in only Sindh textbook; federal textbook could not discuss.

CONSTITUTIONAL HISTORY

Making of Constitution

In this part the third chapter of both, Sindh and Federal textbooks have been analyzed. When Pakistan was created, Pakistan had to face many problems. From all those problems, one of the major problems was that there should be constitution to run the administration of Pakistan in a civilized way. So, it was decided to create a constitution. As there were many questions. "What will be the future of Pakistan? Is there hope for Pakistan to strengthen its economy and for making the country prosperous and civilized?"⁷⁹

The questions mentioned above were in agent to lead this newly separated land toward



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

making a constitution. So, an Assembly was developed to set a constitution, known as Constituent Assembly. It was developed to work under the government of India Act 1935 as the federal legislature. It was divided into two series by headings Constituent Assembly and Constituent Assembly (Legislature). For both reasons, there were the same members and officers who served as a working body.⁸⁰

Furthermore, it is the Islamic Republic, so we should know that is it true that it was aimed to apply all Islamic laws in the state. For this purpose, we have to look at some other history books written by distinguished scholars and authors of all time. As Keith Callard writes in his book that Pakistan was not created on a cultural, economic; language, or regional basis but on a feeling of insecurity.⁸¹

Moreover, the writer quoted Sir Syed Ahmed Khan's statement "It is not possible in these circumstances that the two nations with different religious backgrounds could not rule the on the same land with equal power. And it is necessary the land would be conquered only by one of them".⁸²

Above mentioned references are the best ones to review the history of Pakistan's Constitution and it helps to more learn about the constitution. But in Sindh and Federal textbooks why these worth-knowing facts are not written? Our new generation needs to know all these facts about our country's history. There are many events except the constitution are not mentioned or written in our textbooks properly. It's a big and major issue that is not highlighted and not important for our administration. It is harming our new generation's future and loss of knowing Pakistan's history. It is said that we learn a lot from our history and we can change our future by learning from our past mistakes.

Unfortunately, a main and important speech by the founder of the state is not part of the syllabus. Here arises a question does it seems just to keep the student unaware of the political and religious ideas of their leader and Quaid? "In this independent Republic of Pakistan, all of you are free to practice your religious beliefs no matter which religious sect you are leading. You are free to go to your mosques you are free to go to your temples in this independent Republic of Pakistan".⁸³

Meanwhile, three Round Table Conferences were held in London during 1930-32, to resolve the Indian Constitutional problem. The first Conference was held in November 1930 and two more sessions over the next two years. The Muslim and Hindu leaders were invited to these conferences, and they did not agree. In 1932, the British government announced a Communal Award which constituted the basis of the Government of India Act, of 1935.⁸⁴

Under the Communal Award, Muslims were given percentages of seats in various provisional legislatures corresponding in those provinces where they have a Muslim population. As per Jinnah's fourteen points, one-third of the British Indian seat was reserved for Muslims. But the Hindus denied and refuse the Award... Both sides disagreed with each other's perceptions. "After a long time and discussion, the Round Table Conference resulted in the Government of India. Act, 1935, which provided the "Federation of India" comprising provinces and princely states with independent legislative provinces of the British-India with the British Provinces and assemblies in all of India and create the Central Government with cooperating both the British provinces and princely states.⁸⁵

The Muslim League and Congress were both critical of the Government of India Act 1935, But they both decided to take parting the elections which were held under it during the first weeks of 1937. In the elections Congress won in seven of the eleven provinces of British India, these victories turned later in favor of Indian Independence.



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

Before elections, the Muslim League was reorganized by Quaid-e-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah who returned to India in 1934, after the silence of nearly five years in England. The Muslim League could not win a majority of Muslim seats ever since it has reorganized. The only hope for Muslim League had that the performance of the Indian National Congress in Muslim constituencies was bad. Congress leadership was getting arrogant and changing their attitude after winning the elections, "The classic example was the Congress leader's refusal to form a coalition government with Muslim League in United Provinces. Even they asked the Muslim League leaders to dissolve the league parliamentary party and join Congress."⁸⁶

With the beginning of World War II in September 1939, the viceroy of India Lord Linlithgow declared entrance of India into the war without discussion of Provisional Governments. In case Jinnah called a general session of the All India Muslim League in Lahore in 1940 to review and discuss the reasons and analyze the defeat of the Muslim League in the Indian General Elections of 1937 in some of the Muslim-majority Provinces. These annual sessions were held from March 22-24, 1940 at Minto Park, Lahore. These were historical sessions of the Muslim League. In sessions, Quaid e- Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah discussed the events of the last few months, and he presented his own solutions for Muslim problems in British India. He said the problem of India was not of an inter- Communal nature, but manifestly an international one and must be treated as such.⁸⁷

Jinnah addressed to nation why we need a separate nation, he highlighted the previous issues faced by Muslims and some religious insecurities and language differences, and many other problems. On March 23, was declared 1940 Minto Park, Lahore session the historic Resolution by Muslim League that also came to known as Pakistan Resolution.

After the failure of the Simla Conference (1945), Lord Wavell announced elections of Central and provisional legislature which was held in the winter of 1945. Muslim league and Congress took part in the elections, as both parties knew that elections would be crucial for the future of India. The League wanted to sweep the Muslim constituencies to prove that they were the only representatives of Muslims.

"Both parties entered the field with different slogans. The provisional election result was held in early 1946. Congress won most of the non-Muslim seats while on the other side, the Muslim league succeed to get approximately 95 percent of Muslim seats."⁸⁸

All attempts of the British government to establish peace between the two big parties failed and the result of the general elections 1945-46 underline to find a quick solution to the political deadlock. The British Government, after all the efforts to save the Cabinet Mission Plan in December 1946, and have to move towards a plan for the partition of India.

Under this plan, the British Government declared that India and Pakistan formed from areas in which Muslims were in the majority population and the princely state could freely join either India or Pakistan.⁸⁹ Both the Muslim League and Congress accepted the plan. After the independence of Pakistan, the country was run in accordance with the provisions of the Government of India Act of 1935 (and the Indian Independence Act, of 1947), which was adopted as a provisional Constitution for the country with some necessary amendments.⁹⁰ The Constituent Assembly of Pakistan was assigned the important task of framing a permanent Constitution.

On March 7, 1949, Pakistan's first prime minister Nawabzada Liaquat Ali Khan introduced the Objectives Resolution in the Constituent Assembly to define the basic



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

principles of the new state. On the same day, a committee comprising the name of Basic Principles Committee of 24 Members to prepare a draft Constitution on the basis of objective Resolution.⁹¹

Prime Minister Nawabzada Liaquat Ali Khan was assassinated on 16 October 1951 and Khawaja Nazimuddin take over the prime minister seat on October 17, 1951. After seven years of failure to produce an agreement, on fundamental issues such as regional representation or the structure of the Constitution. When Mohammad Ali Bogra had taken over as prime minister of Pakistan, a final draft of the constitution was prepared in 1954. The final draft of the Constitution could be placed in the House for approval, just before that the Assembly was dissolved by Governor General Ghulam Muhammad on October 24, 1954. This was the first ever albeit a civilian coup d'état in Pakistan's history. "Molana Tamizuddin president of the Assembly challenged the Assembly dissolution case in the Sindh Chief Court and won the case. In return, the Government knocked on the door of the Federal Court where the Chief Justice, Mohammad Munir gave the judgment in favor of the Government and Molana Tamizuddin lost the case. Somehow, the constitutional impasse was resolved and a new constituent Assembly was created on May 28, 1956, under Governor General's Order No. 12 of 1955.⁹²

After many ups and downs, the Assembly achieved its mandate by giving the first constitution of 1956. The prime minister at that time was Chaudhry Muhammad Ali. The Constituent Assembly also reconstituted itself by changing national legislatures to the Legislative Assembly.

Thus the continuously regional rivalry, religious debate, and many internal issues were weakening the power of the Muslim league and cause to political instability in the country. President Iskandar Mirza abrogated the Constitution and imposed Martial law in the Country with the help of armed forces under the command of General Ayub Khan. The General's takeover was welcomed by large segments of the population who were tired of politicians 'performance since the independence of Pakistan. He appointed a Constitution Commission on February 17, 1960. The main objective of his commission was, how best democracy can be strengthened and framed according to the country's socio-political environment and Islamic principles of Justice.⁹³ The commission submitted its report, according to this report, a new constitution was framed.

There were many disputes after separation in and after 1947 and it seemed mandatory to make it clear that this new land is separated on the basis of religion as a result of all these arguments, they passed Objectives Resolution in 1949.⁹⁴

Constitutions of 1956, 1962 and 1973

In the constitution of 1956, there resemble only two features mentioned in Sindh and Federal board of Pakistan Studies textbooks; the Sovereignty of Allah, the very first provision, mentioned in both books, is the Supreme ruler is God and this sacred land is, entrusted to its people as a sacred gift.⁹⁵ Once again, if I look back to the objective Resolution, is not it clear that the constitution has a deep link with all that arguments and disputes?

Students from both the Sindh and Federal boards read and understand this provision, so this is presenting an Islamic and only Islamic mindset. It is clear that whether you are a Muslim or not, you are living in an Islamic country, and you have to obey Islamic laws. After this, I have to discuss and look upon some other History and constitutional books; Mr. Hamid Khan writes that while making the constitution many arguments



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

were argued that religion is a personal matter and the state has nothing to do with it.⁹⁶ But Mr. Jinnah criticized and condemned this dock time and opposed it himself.

The second similar feature of both books from the same constitution is to develop of close relations with Muslim counties. This provision clearly declares that I brought to the Muslims through Islam that whether you are living in one country or in different parts of the world you are like a body; according to the teachings of Prophet Muhammad (P.B.U.H).

After the constitution of 1956, we will discuss the Constitution of 1962. But maybe the students are wondering about what happened to the previous constitution. So, the answer is, briefly you can find in the Sindh textbook too, in 1968 Field-Marshal Ayub Khan came into power after the abrogation the constitution of 1956 by Iskandar Mirza.⁹⁷ It was really a non-democratic government that was said to have many democratic plans for the future of Pakistan but it was the beginning of the end of United Pakistan.⁹⁸ After this situation was left with no constitution or more than these years. Ayub Khan was removed from the presidency in 1969. So now we should go back to discussing the constitution of 1962. In both Sindh and the Federal board, the first similar feature is the objective Resolution on became the preamble a constitution. It seems very beneficial part to have this provision in both books; it will help students in understanding why there is a need for a constitution and what was it supposed to do.

In the 1956 constitution, the name of the state was the Republic of Pakistan: The Constitution of 1962 replaced it with the Islamic Republic of Pakistan. Once again it becomes clear that in every sphere of life; Pakistan was an Islamic country. Mr. Hamid Khan writes “The name replaced by the Islamic Republic of Pakistan as a result of public protest”.⁹⁹

The third provision that is similar is the supremacy of Islamic laws. According to this provision, every Muslim was ensured to lead their life in the light of Islamic principles. This feature could have a great impact on the Muslim community that going away from the teaching of Islam as a sin in God's sight as well as an illegal action according to the constitution. After the constitution of 1962, another constitution was introduced known as the Constitution of 1973.

In a letter when different arguments were arising that religion is a matter between man and Good and the state has nothing to do with it, Mr. Jinnah writes to Gandhi, Islam is a complete code of life, it not only a matter between man and God. Islam gives many commands to his followers regarding society.¹⁰⁰

The third similar feature that is mentioned is the presidential offices were made restricted only to Muslims. It is necessary according to the Constitution of 1973 to have faith in Islam for being a prime minister or president of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan.

The last and fourth similar feature of the constitution of 1973 there was made a specific definition of Muslim, if we look deeply at this provision, it is clear that once again it is a representation of a Muslim and only Muslim mindset.

Impacts

I have to look further at the differences and their impact on the students. Federal textbook board contains only Islamic provisions of all the constitutions while in Context of Sindh board textbook contains many other important provisions along with Islamic provisions, such as. The Governor General was replaced by the president. The Federal Parliamentary system was introduced in the country.



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

By comparing both books, one could come to know that the Sindh board textbook is much better than the Federal board textbook. I have some reasons to declare whether you agree with it or not. First, the Sindh board starts by introducing the constitution. Surely, while reading the constitution a student must be curious about the meaning of the constitution. Sindh board, moreover, clear why there was a need for a constitution and what it was supposed to be. So these explanations left the students with none of such queries. In contrast, the Federal board comes directly on the provisions so the students must be wondering about why they are being taught this and why it is it necessary to know about the constitution.

Second, while reading the Federal board textbook, it seems like a constitution of an Islamic religious institute rather than a country. The textbook contains mostly Islamic provisions. So, students from different religious beliefs must be alienated. It also contains a provision declaring Lahori and Qadianis non-Muslims. In a classroom a student could have many questions about these provisions, but would he ask? The answer is my friend, blowing in the wind. It is up to the reader what he thinks of it. The Sindh board textbook does not contain such controversial provisions, so the students that are reading this book must be polite behavior toward different sects and religions.

An Era of General Muhammad Ayoub Khan

If one goes through the history of Pakistan, he encounters some non-democratic departments intervening in the politics and administration of the county. Do they have any business in politics? Does the public elect them to rule? Do not they get the power by-elections? Such types of questions must arise when a curious mind looks upon History.

The main service of this essay is to point out whether students are acquainted with these incidents or not. Reading textbooks Pakistan Studies in Sindh and Federal board, it is to be pointed out that the students are reading these books; do they know about Dictatorship or Martial law? Do they question their confusion?

First of all, I have to clear it that the Sindh board gives at least, a very short portion to the Martial laws in contrast Federal board does not mention it. Now, we are coming to my main concern.

Abrogation of the Constitution of 1956

As I go through the Sindh board textbooks the writer makes it clear what a constitution is. He writes that constitution is a set of laws, rules, and regulations that are made to run a country in a civilized manner.¹⁰¹ Our students are learning that laws are equal for everyone whether he or she belongs to any class or caste. Simultaneously our history reveals the constitution has been abrogated many times by above mentioned non-democratic parties. Fortunately, or unfortunately Sindh board mentions who abrogated the first-ever constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan.

It is clearly mentioned in the textbook that Field Marshal Ayoub Khan came into power in 1958 and ruled over United Pakistan for more than ten years. The textbook does not explain anything else about getting this power: G.W. Chaudhary writes “No Muslim since the fall of the Mughal Emperor ruled over a wider area in the Indian Subcontinent for a longer period more effectively than General Ayoub Khan”.¹⁰²

Here arise a question regarding the textbook; does it seem just to keep the students unaware of the cause and effects of this dictatorship? Or, do these textbooks serve them to know the real events that have many long-lasting effects on the future of their



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

county? Students that are reading this book must be wondering about what good changes and development General Ayoub brought to this land. It said that and is written in his books that the era of Ayoub Khan was supposed to develop Pakistan as a 'Model' for testing the world.¹⁰³ But Do they mention what happened after Ayoub Khan's intervention in the administration of the county? No, the answer is no. We have to look upon our history books, by authentic writers to teach or chase a conclusion G.W. Chaudhary writes it clearly that the beginning of Ayoub empowerment was an end to United Pakistan.¹⁰⁴ After the fall of Ayoub, in 1969, there arose many political religious and regional crises which resulted in the partition of Pakistan later in 1971.

Is it honest to keep students away from the truth? Do their parents know what are their children seeking and learning? Questions are arising to be answered by parents, students, or the teacher himself.

The era of Ayoub is said to be a green revolution for the Republic of Pakistan. It is said that he developed a basic structure of democracy but we found a written piece of Arnold J. Toynbee in G.W. Chaudhary's book, he writes;

"It does suggest a possible way in which politically and economically backward countries can arise at self-government on our western lines. So I should say that the Pakistan experiment in so-called basic democracy deserves our sympathy and support and certainly deserves our attention.¹⁰⁵ Once again it becomes clear that there is a huge distinction between history and the rest of the world's view opinion towards this abrogation of Pakistan than ours."

A Glance upon Federal Board Textbook

In Sindh textbook there is mentioned about Martial law of General Ayoub Khan. Therefore, students more or less clear about what happened to the constitution of 1956 and why they developed a new constitution in 1962. But if we look, in contrast, at the Federal board textbook, we don't find a single word about that that was brought between 1956 and the constitution of 1962. Here again, arise a question that is desperate to be answered by the Pakistan Studies department and that is: if the students are not learning about all there major incidents of Pakistan's History in Pakistan Studies: where will they find their answer? It has been mentioned earlier that the incident of the fall of Dhaka happens just after the end of Gen. Ayoub's era. If we don't let the students know about the first-ever martial laws; how they come to know the cause and effect of the separation of East and West Pakistan? If I look back to the history books; it is clearly mentioned that the movement of partition of Pakistan was based on three 'R's':¹⁰⁶

The first R is Religion

The Second 'R' is Region

The Third 'R' is Realities

When a student goes through all these riddles he must be curious about who triggered all these phenomena. But it is only possible when a student is clearly known what happened before 1971.

A student that is learning from a Sindh board textbook surely could ask such types of questions; But on other hand, a student that does not know about the abrogation, could not ask a question 'who abrogated?', Here I mentioned a quote from the ancient Greek philosopher: "Nothing comes out of nothing" If apply this to topic it means that to ask a question you have to know something. You need a minor clue to reach a wide area filled with gold. So, it seems a very clear and huge lack of information about a game-changing event in the history of Pakistan is not mentioned in the textbook.



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

War of 1965

There is a very important event that happens, in Ayoub's era that is not even mentioned in both Sindh as well as in the Federal textbook board. Does it seem just to the students who are learning and trying to comprehend Pakistan Studies? I honestly have to mention some aspects of the second Kashmir war (1965) and then it is up to the reader/children/parents to think about it.

The conflict started as a result of Operation Gibraltar; which aimed to enter the Pakistan military forces in Kashmir to rebel against Indian rule. It was the beginning of the war. The war lasted for seventeen days between Pakistan and India and ended with an intervention of the Soviet Union and the United States by putting a cease-fire and declaring the Tashkent Declaration.

Here it is necessary to mention about the conflict's background with the hope, that it would be really helpful in index standing the facts and figures of this conflict. Since the partition of India, India and Pakistan remained in an argument on the major issues: First, the Kashmir issue and the second the Rann of Kutch as a barren deserted area in the Indian province Gujrat.

The India-Pakistan war of 1965 was an outcome of having some expectations towards a peaceful settlement of the conflict of Kashmir issue and the clashes, which were happening on the border of Rann of Kutch. After going through all this information about the triggering point of the war, isn't it become clear that the children are being kept unaware of something worth knowing? There are arranged many sessions in our schools and colleges to pay heart warning tributes to the martyrs of the war of 1965, but the question is; Do children have a serious intention towards these sessions? Yes, it could be but only when students come to know everything about history and they get the right answers.

My topic is not completed yet. There were also major issues and agreements of Pakistan with the rest of the world in the era of Ayoub Khan which should be known;

Clash in the Rann of Kutch

As I mentioned above Rann of Kutch was also an issue to be solved between India and Pakistan. If it is a deserted and barren land expended between Sindh and Gujrat, (Province of India) which floods during the monsoon season. It was a subject of conflict between the Princely State of Kutch and Bombay's presidency. But right after the partition, the Indian Government claimed to master the complete region of about 3,500 square miles, so Pakistan protested. In the end, both countries decided to maintain a ceasefire.

After reading this paragraph from the book, it becomes clear what is said to be history. If it was the part of textbooks that we are talking about, the student must be very clear about the facts and figures of these arising arguments of Pakistan with other foreign countries. Obviously, this way put so many impacts on the coming day which we are living through today. So, students must to be clear about history.

Operation Gibraltar

A plan was made in the early 60s by Pakistan Army to enter the commandos and other military forces in Kashmir Known as Operation Gibraltar. When all the hopes of rising and falling of expecting a peaceful settlement, of the Kashmir issue, were lost by Pakistan it turned to the world community to make the Indian government fulfill the given pledge, that it will be Kashmiri Public to decide Kashmir's future.



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

Imagine it was a part of the textbook. It becomes clear that students must be wondering if the pledge was to decide the Kashmiri people their future, then what is happening now. Who is ruling in Kashmir on both sides? Do Kashmiri people have the right to decide their state's direction? These questions could be asked and would be really difficult to answer.

To be continued, I have to mention the word of Ayoub Khan, which he spoke, just after the implementation of Martial Law I'll further leave some questions to my readers after a short analysis. General Ayoub Khan speaks; my countrymen! Today I want to speak to you on some issues that are important and dreadful at the same time. We ought to understand these issues in that there is a light of hope for coming generations. Moreover, with an understanding of all these phenomena, we can have some creative thoughts toward the future of our county. You must have listened to the announcement that Mr. President has abrogated the constitution and implemented Martial law. It is done for the belief that we can save our country from being devastated. There was no either way. If everything would have left as it was then the coming generations would not forgive us, we all know it's very well that this situation of anarchism is spread by the thugpoliticians.¹⁰⁷

Now, let me come to the questions about which I talked in starting. First, it is to be borne in our minds especially in students 'minds that the coming generations about whom General Ayoub was worried are us? So ask yourself, what steps did that marshal take toward your good and bright future? Or look at your past with no Military Government and think about the time you are living in.

I further have to continue the same speech of general Ayoub, in which he is addressing the people of an independent Republic of Pakistan. He speaks, moreover, that these politicians started fighting to fulfill their desire of getting power just after the Quid-e-Azam and Liaquat Ali Khan, without thinking about what would it cause to the country. They don't have any constructive ideas in their heads, except they put the people in prejudiced and sects quote whether the country is or not.¹⁰⁸

Here, once again, some fundamental questions could arise in a curious mind what was the sole purpose of these Martial laws? What developments they have done to the states? For, everyone from today's generation is composing current after Zia's Pakistan to the past and before Zia. So, what answer might be found? This is the only way it could have been thought to keep the administrations away from this soul-aching and mind-blowing question, do not let the children learn all the ups and downs of the History of Pakistan. After an analyzing the two main and important parts of the speech one could come to know it's a huge loss to the knowledge of history that textbooks don't contain such important and questionable parts.

Now I am coming to the end of the speech Gen. Ayub winds his speech up by saying, my countrymen! I have portrayed a detailed picture of the purpose of his Martial laws and that it has been done only for the prosperity and development of our country. Let's come and pray together that May God's mercy and help be with us in fulfilling all our dreams and developmental ideas for the country.¹⁰⁹ This ending I left to the teachers, children, and parents; what might they think of it and in how many ways they can question it.

Look towards the comparison between Sindh textbook board and Federal textbook board the imposing of Martial law 1969, the 1970 elections and the crisis of 1970-71 is not mentioned in Federal textbook board by the author. The author of Sindh textbook board mentioned all headings briefly. In my perspective the purpose of teaching history of Pakistan is to keep our children aware that what kind of difficulties



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

had been faced after the independence of Pakistan. According to the national curriculum of Pakistan studies it is mentioned that affects and the difficulties in the way of implementing Islamic provisions and Constitution is also included on the curriculum¹¹⁰. So it is mandatory to mention these topics in both books.

In 1969 the martial law was imposed. The martial law administrations accepted all the demands of the political parties and issued programmed of holding general elections in the country on the basis of adult franchise.¹¹¹ it was the 1st elections in the history of Pakistan. The first Martial law took place in 1958 in the era of Ayoub Khan. I am discussing first Martial law because it is relevant to second martial law because due to martial law Pakistan was in better situation. So it was strictly followed. The second martial law Conditions was changed. As mentioned in Sindh textbook board he ended 1 unit scheme (the province of the West Pakistan) introduced by Ayoub Khan and divided into four provinces (Punjab, Sindh, NWFP, Balochistan). He also announced that seats will be directly proportional to the population. He organized the fairest elections in the history of Pakistan i.e. one man one vote. He introduced democracy system.¹¹²

In December 1970 general elections were held and these elections 63 political parties made their own groups but these were the major parties and took part in elections Muslim league convention, council and Qayum league, National Awami Party, Pakistan People's Party, Awami league, Jamiat Ulma e Pakistan, Jamiat Ulma i Islam, Pakistan democratic party which included Awami league (Nawabzada group), Justice aparty and Nizam e Islam party).¹¹³ This is a martial law of 1969, this is so important topic in my view and on federal textbook these topics are not mentioned. This will impact on Federal students if it would not published so how they got to know that what is the history of Pakistan after independence. On 28th November 1969, President General Yahya Khan held the first general election program, according to this program political activities were concerned from 1st January, 1970 on one-man one vote to be held on 5th October 1970. Yahya Khan issued the legal frame work order on 28th March 1970 regarding the holding of general election and preparation of new Constitution.¹¹⁴

CONCLUSION

This study reveals that the representation of historical themes in Pakistan Studies textbooks prescribed by the Sindh and Federal Boards differs significantly in emphasis, interpretation, and pedagogical approach. While both textbooks aim to promote patriotism, national unity, and an understanding of Pakistan's ideological foundation, the selection and presentation of historical content reflect distinct regional and institutional perspectives.

The Federal Board textbook tends to follow a more centralized and state-oriented narrative, emphasizing the role of national leaders, the Pakistan Movement, and ideological consolidation. In contrast, the Sindh Board textbook incorporates comparatively broader socio-political contexts and regional contributions, offering a more inclusive yet sometimes fragmented understanding of national history.

These differences highlight the absence of a unified national framework for history education and raise important questions about the development of critical thinking, historical inquiry, and identity formation among students. To strengthen national cohesion and historical understanding, it is essential to harmonize curriculum objectives across boards while ensuring balanced representation of regional, cultural, and political dimensions of Pakistan's past. A more integrated, analytical, and



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

evidence-based approach to history teaching can help students develop a nuanced appreciation of their nation's evolution and foster a more informed and reflective citizenship.

REFERENCES

1. Dr. Masood-ul-Hassan Bukhari, Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii (Karachi: Nafees Academy, 2011), 1.
2. Sahibzada Abdul Rasool, Hindu o Pak Tareekh (Lahore: Educational, 1985), 13.
3. Khursheed Kamal Aziz, Making of Pakistan (Lahore: Abad Printers, 1986), 17.
4. Roe M. Christenson, Ideologies and Modern Politics (Harper : 1981), 2.
5. M. Ikram Rabbani, Pakistan Affairs (Lahore: Zahid Bashir Printers, 2022), 1.
6. K. Ali, A new history of Indo-Pak (Karachi: Pakistan book centre, 1994), 428.
7. Ibid, 424.
8. Ibid, 425.
9. Ishtiaq Husain Qureshi, The struggle for Pakistan (Karachi: BCC &T press, 2018), 39
10. Syed Muhammad Khan, December 3, 2019 Islamic Caliphates. Retrieved from https://www.worldhistory.org/Islamic_Caliphates/
11. Haroon Rasheed, Pakistan the successful culmination, (Lahore: Publishers Emporium, 1990), 115.
12. K. Ali, A new history of Indo-Pak (Karachi: Pakistan book centre, 1994), 432.
13. Ibid, 433.
14. Dr. Muhammad Azam Chaudhry, Pakistan studies (Karachi: Ghazanfar academy, 2018), 115
15. Gul Shahzad Sarwar, An introduction to Pakistan studies (Karachi: Qamar kitab Ghar, 2002), 76.
16. Munwar Ali Khan, March 11, 2012. Role of provinces in Pakistan movement. Retrieved from <https://aboutpak.blogspot.com/2012/03/role-of-provinces-in-making-of-pakistan.html?m=1>
17. Dr. Muhammad Azam Chaudhary, Pakistan studies (Karachi: Ghazanfar academy, 2018), 121.
18. M. Ikram Rabbani, Pakistan Affairs (Lahore: Zahid Bashir Printers, 2022), 77.
19. Gul Shahzad Sarwar, An introduction to Pakistan studies (Karachi: Qamar kitab Ghar, 2002), 96.
20. M. Ikram Rabbani, Pakistan Affairs (Lahore: Zahid Bashir Printers, 2022), 80.
21. Gul Shahzad Sarwar, An introduction to Pakistan studies (Karachi: Qamar kitab Ghar, 2002), 107.
22. M. Ikram Rabbani, Pakistan affairs (Lahore: Zahid Bashir Printers, 2022), 90.



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

23. Gul Shahzad Sarwar, An introduction to Pakistan studies (Karachi: Qamar kitab Ghar, 2002), 116.
24. M. Ikram Rabbani, Pakistan Affairs (Lahore: Zahid Bashir Printers, 2022), 91.
25. Ibid, 123.
26. Gul Shahzad Sarwar, An introduction to Pakistan studies (Karachi: Qamar kitab Ghar, 2002), 119.
27. Ibid, 123.
28. Dr. Muhammad Azam Chaudhry, Pakistan studies (Karachi: Ghazanfar academy, 2018), 191
29. M. Ikram Rabbani, Pakistan Affairs (Lahore: Zahid Bashir Printers, 2022), 91.
30. Ibid, 98.
31. Dr. Masood-ul-Hassan Bukhari, Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii (Karachi: Nafees Academy, 2011), 28-30.
32. Dr. Abdul Qadir Khan, Textbook of Pakistan Studies grade 11 & 12 (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2020), 29.
33. Ayesha Jalal, The struggle of Pakistan (Harvard: Harvard University press, 2011),40.
34. James Wynbrandt, A Brief History of Pakistan (New York: Checkmark Books, 2008), 160.
35. Government of Pakistan, National Curriculum Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii, (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2002), 4.
36. Munwar Ali Khan, March 11, 2012. Role of provinces in Pakistan movement. Retrieved from <https://aboutpak.blogspot.com>
37. Dr. Masood-ul-Hassan Bukhari, Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii (Karachi: Nafees Academy, 2011), 33.
38. Dr. Abdul Qadir Khan, Textbook of Pakistan Studies grade 11 & 12 (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2020), 30.
39. M. Ikram Rabbani, Pakistan Affairs (Lahore: Zahid Bashir Printers, 2022), 97.
40. Government of Pakistan, National Curriculum Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii, (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2002), 4.
41. Ibid, 4.
42. Dr. Abdul Qadir Khan, Textbook of Pakistan Studies grade 11 & 12 (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2020), 31.
43. Government of Pakistan, National Curriculum Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii, (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2002), 4.
44. Dr. Masood-ul-Hassan Bukhari, Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii (Karachi:



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

Nafees Academy, 2011), 34-39.

45. Shamshad Ahmad, *Pakistan and World Affairs* (Lahore: Jahangir World Time, 2014), 135-136.
46. Dr. Abdul Qadir Khan, *Textbook of Pakistan Studies grade 11 & 12* (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2020), 31.
47. Government of Pakistan, *National Curriculum Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii*, (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2002), 4.
48. Dr. Abdul Qadir Khan, *Textbook of Pakistan Studies grade 11 & 12* (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2020), 35-36.
49. Government of Pakistan, *National Curriculum Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii*, (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2002), 4.
50. Dr. Masood-ul-Hassan Bukhari, *Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii* (Karachi: Nafees Academy, 2011), 40.
51. Dr. Abdul Qadir Khan, *Textbook of Pakistan Studies grade 11 & 12* (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2020), 37.
52. Speech of Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah, April 22, 2010. Student's role in nation-building 24 March 1948. Retrieved from <http://www.jinnahofpakistan.com>
53. Stanley Wolpert, *Jinnah of Pakistan* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1984), 337.
54. Dr. Masood-ul-Hassan Bukhari, *Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii* (Karachi: Nafees Academy, 2011), 40.
55. Government of Pakistan, *National Curriculum Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii*, (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2002), 4.
56. Dr. Masood-ul-Hassan Bukhari, *Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii* (Karachi: Nafees Academy, 2011), 41.
57. Dr. Abdul Qadir Khan, *Textbook of Pakistan Studies grade 11 & 12* (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2020), 37-38.
58. Stanley Wolpert, *Jinnah of Pakistan* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1984), 354.
59. Government of Pakistan, *National Curriculum Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii*, (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2002), 4.
60. Speech of Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah to the civil servants in Peshawar. April, 1948. Election Commission of Pakistan. Retrieved from <https://www.ecp.gov.pk>
61. Dr. Masood-ul-Hassan Bukhari, *Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii* (Karachi: Nafees Academy, 2011), 42.
62. Dr. Abdul Qadir Khan, *Textbook of Pakistan Studies grade 11 & 12* (Islamabad:



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

National Book Foundation, 2020), 38.

63. Government of Pakistan, National Curriculum Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii, (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2002), 4.

64. M. Ikram Rabbani, Pakistan Affairs (Lahore: Zahid Bashir Printers, 2022), 97.

65. Ibid, 98.

66. Dr. Abdul Qadir Khan, Textbook of Pakistan Studies grade 11 & 12 (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2020), 38-39.

67. Ibid, 40.

68. Government of Pakistan, National Curriculum Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii, (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2002), 4.

69. Dr. Masood-ul-Hassan Bukhari, Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii (Karachi: Nafees Academy, 2011), 42.

70. Ibid, 46.

71. Government of Pakistan, National Curriculum Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii, (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2002), 4.

72. Dr. Masood-ul-Hassan Bukhari, Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii (Karachi: Nafees Academy, 2011), 43.

73. Lawrence Ziring, Pakistan Foreign Policy (London: Oxford University Press, 1991), 17.

74. Dr. Abdul Qadir Khan, Textbook of Pakistan Studies grade 11 & 12 (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2020), 40.

75. Government of Pakistan, National Curriculum Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii, (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2002), 4.

76. Dr. Masood-ul-Hassan Bukhari, Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii (Karachi: Nafees Academy, 2011), 44.

77. Dr. Abdul Qadir Khan, Textbook of Pakistan Studies grade 11 & 12 (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2020), 41.

78. Government of Pakistan, National Curriculum Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii, (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2002), 5.

79. Keith Callard, Pakistan a Political Study (New York: George Allen & Unwin, 1957), 13.

80. Ibid, 85.

81. Ibid, 74.

82. Ibid, 11.

83. Ibid, 107.

84. Shamshad Ahmad, Pakistan and World Affairs (Lahore: Jahangir World Time,



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

2014), 112.

85. Ibid, 113.

86. Ibid, 114.

87. Ibid, 117.

88. Ibid, 125-126.

89. Ibid, 129.

90. Dr. Masood-ul-Hassan Bukhari, Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii (Karachi: Nafees Academy, 2011), 47.

91. Shamshad Ahmad, Pakistan and World Affairs (Lahore: Jahangir World Time, 2014), 167.

92. Ibid, 168.

93. Ibid, 169.

94. Hamid Khan, A Political and Constitutional History of Pakistan (Karachi: Oxford university press, 2001), 57.

95. Ibid, 97.

96. Ibid, 138.

97. G.W. Choudhary, The last days of United Pakistan(London: G.Hurst, 1974), 7.

98. Ibid, 9.

99. Hamid Khan, A Political and Constitutional History of Pakistan (Karachi: Oxford university press, 2001), 86.

100. Ibid, 89.

101. Dr. Masood-Ul-Hassan Bukhari, Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii (Karachi: Nafees Academy, 2011), 87.

102. G.W. Choudhary, The last days of United Pakistan (London: G.Hurst, 1974),11.

103. Ibid, 11.

104. Ibid, 12.

105. Ibid, 13.

106. Ibid, 15.

107. Dr. Syed Jaffar Ahmed, Shabguzida Sahar (Karachi: Mass printer, 2020) 51.

108. Ibid, 128.

109. Ibid, 14.

110. Government of Pakistan, National Curriculum Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii, (Islamabad: National Book Foundation, 2002), 10.

111. Dr. Masood-ul-Hassan Bukhari, Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii (Karachi: Nafees Academy, 2011), 57.

112. Dr. Masood-ul-Hassan Bukhari, Pakistan Studies for class xi and xii (Karachi:



Vol. 3 No. 11 (November) (2025)

Nafees Academy, 2011), 57-58.

113. Ibid, 58.

114. Ibid, 104.